Borderline Personality Disorder in Primary Care

Raz Gross, MD, MPH; Mark Olfson, MD, MPH; Marc Gameroff, MA; Steven Shea, MD; Adriana Feder, MD; Milton Fuentes, PsyD; Rafael Lantigua, MD; Myrna M. Weissman, PhD

Background: Borderline personality disorder (BPD) is a severe and chronic psychiatric disorder characterized by marked impulsivity, instability of affect and interpersonal relationships, and suicidal behavior that can complicate medical care. Few data are available on its prevalence or clinical presentation outside of specialty mental health care settings.

Methods: We examined data from a survey conducted on a systematic sample (N=218) from an urban primary care practice to study the prevalence, clinical features, comorbidity, associated impairment, and rate of treatment of BPD. Psychiatric assessments were conducted by mental health professionals using structured clinical interviews.

Results: Lifetime prevalence of BPD was 6.4% (14/218 patients). The BPD group had a high rate of current suicidal ideation (3 patients [21.4%]), bipolar disorder (3 [21.4%]), and major depressive (5 [35.7%]) and anxiety (8 [57.1%]) disorders. Half of the BPD patients reported not receiving mental health treatment in the past year and nearly as many (6 [42.9%]) were not recognized by their primary care physicians as having an ongoing emotional or mental health problem.

Conclusions: The prevalence of BPD in primary care is high, about 4-fold higher than that found in general community studies. Despite availability of various pharmacological and psychological interventions that are helpful in treating symptoms of BPD, and despite the association of this disorder with suicidal ideation, comorbid psychiatric disorders, and functional impairment, BPD is largely unrecognized and untreated. These findings are also important for the primary care physician, because unrecognized BPD may underlie difficult patient-physician relationships and complicate medical treatment.

Arch Intern Med. 2002;162:53-60
PATIENTS AND METHODS

SETTING

These data derive from a general medicine practice–based study that was conducted at the Associates in Internal Medicine, the faculty and resident group practice of the Division of General Medicine at the College of Physicians and Surgeons, Columbia University, New York, NY. The practice serves approximately 18,000 patients each year.

SAMPLE

We performed the study in 2 phases. In the first phase, described in detail elsewhere,21 a systematic sample of consecutive adult primary care patients with scheduled appointments was invited to participate in the study. Eligible patients included those who were aged 18 to 70 years, made at least 1 previous visit to the clinic, could speak and understand English or Spanish, and were scheduled for face-to-face contact with their primary care physician. Patients were excluded from the study if their current general health status prohibited completion of survey forms and if assessment results showed them to be highly suicidal.

A total of 1,264 patients met study eligibility criteria, and 1,005 (79.5%) consented to participate. Study participants were slightly younger than eligible nonparticipants. A random subsample of patients from the first study phase was selected to participate in the second phase. The selected and nonselected patients did not differ in their sociodemographic characteristics. Most of the selected patients (82.3%) agreed to participate in the second phase. Those who refused did not significantly differ with respect to sex, race or ethnicity, family income, and mean age, but had lower educational attainment.

Hueston et al15 relied on self-report, a more limited approach compared with clinical interviews, in which responses may be affected substantially by other relatively common psychiatric symptoms such as depression and anxiety.11 Thus, the high rates of BPD in these studies, which resemble the high end of the BPD prevalence range reported from psychiatric outpatient settings, may be due to selection biases and measurement problems. In addition, none of the available primary care studies collected comprehensive data on comorbid psychiatric disorders and symptoms, functioning, and treatment rates of patients with BPD.

We examined data from a cross-sectional survey of randomly sampled patients in an urban general medicine practice. Assessment included a structured clinical interview for BPD administered by trained mental health professionals to determine the prevalence of BPD in this primary care population and to examine the association between BPD and other mental disorders, suicidal ideation, impairment, and mental health treatment. More specifically, we asked whether substantial numbers of patients in primary care had BPD; whether they are functionally impaired; whether their burden of disease is similar to that of patients with other major mental disorders; and what proportion of these patients are clinically recognized and receive mental health treatment.

The institutional review board of the Department of Medicine, College of Physicians and Surgeons, approved the study protocol, and all the study participants signed informed consent.

MEASUREMENTS

At study intake, patients completed a sociodemographic questionnaire, 5-point self-rated physical and emotional health measures (excellent, very good, good, fair, and poor), sections from the Patient Health Questionnaire, the self-report version of the Primary Care Evaluation of Mental Disorders, including an item for suicidal ideation, to determine whether the patient had “thoughts that you would be better off dead or of hurting yourself in any way” for at least several days in the past 2 weeks.22 Current and lifetime psychotic symptoms were assessed using the psychotic symptoms section of the Mini-International Neuropsychiatric Interview, a structured diagnostic interview that has been used in primary care populations.23 It consists of 8 questions on delusions (eg, “Have you ever believed that people were spying on you?”) and 2 on hallucinations (eg, “Have you ever heard/seen things other people couldn’t hear/see?”). The Mini-International Neuropsychiatric Interview also specifies whether a person has current psychotic symptoms.

Disability was measured using the 10-point self-rated family/home responsibilities and social life subscales from the Sheehan Disability Scale (0 indicates none; 1-3, mild disability; 4-6, moderate; 7-9, marked; and 10, extreme).24,25 Patients were also asked about professional mental health treatment and prescriptions and psychiatric hospital admissions. Data on number of visits to the general medicine practice were obtained through linkage to the computerized medical records database.

Psychiatric diagnoses were ascertained using the Structured Clinical Interview updated to Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fourth Edition (DSM-IV) criteria for BPD. Patients with BPD were similar to the comparison patient and control groups in terms of their age, ethnicity, marital status, education, and household income. More specifically, 142 patients (69.3%) were of Hispanic ancestry; mean age was 53.5 years; 175 (85.3%) reported an annual household income of less than $12,000; and 62 (30.2%) were married or living with a partner.

Sex was the only sociodemographic variable found to be significantly different between the study groups ($\chi^2=7.38; P=.02$). Specifically, significantly more patients with other psychiatric disorders were female (40 patients [90.2%]) compared with BPD patients or controls (11 [78.6%] and 100 [71.4%], respectively). Therefore, all statistics in-

RESULTS

LIFETIME PREVALENCE OF BPD AND SOCIODEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS

Of the 218 patients interviewed, 14 (6.4%) met DSM-IV criteria for BPD. Patients with BPD were similar to the comparison patient and control groups in terms of their age, ethnicity, marital status, education, and household income. More specifically, 142 patients (69.3%) were of Hispanic ancestry; mean age was 53.5 years; 175 (85.3%) reported an annual household income of less than $12,000; and 62 (30.2%) were married or living with a partner.

Sex was the only sociodemographic variable found to be significantly different between the study groups ($\chi^2=7.38; P=.02$). Specifically, significantly more patients with other psychiatric disorders were female (40 patients [90.2%]) compared with BPD patients or controls (11 [78.6%] and 100 [71.4%], respectively). Therefore, all statistics in-
also significantly greater than that of controls (F2,40=8.01, \( P=.001 \)). The rate of comorbidity (ie, presence of at least 1 additional current mental disorder) in the BPD group was compared with rates of psychiatric disorders among non-BPD patients who had at least 1 psychiatric disorder. Prevalences of major depression, dysthymic disorder, anxiety, and substance use disorders were similar in both groups. The 3 patients with current bipolar I disorder (manic-depressive illness) also met criteria for BPD (Table 1).

**PSYCHIATRIC COMORBIDITY**

Assessment by physicians found 6 BPD patients (54.5%), 22 patients with other mental disorders (55.0%), and 38 controls (31.9%) with poor or fair current emotional health (\( \chi^2=7.9, P=.04 \)). Differences between the groups with regard to current physical health were not statistically significant.

**CLINICAL CHARACTERISTICS**

Table 1 shows that BPD patients and patients with other mental disorders had significantly higher rates of current suicidal ideation than controls (\( \chi^2=7.68, P=.02 \)). Ten of the 14 patients with BPD had at least 1 current psychotic symptom, nearly twice as high as and significantly higher than the rate observed for patients with other mental disorders, and 7 times higher than the rate observed for controls. Among patients with at least 1 lifetime psychotic symptom, the mean number of lifetime psychotic symptoms per patient in the BPD group was also significantly greater than that of controls (\( F_{2,50}=8.01, P=.001 \)). The most common symptoms in patients with BPD were chronic feelings of emptiness, sudden mood changes, impulsivity, and unstable and intense interpersonal relationships.
Patients with BPD and patients with other disorders had lower self-perceived emotional and physical health than the controls and significantly lower (worse) mean scores on the mental component summary of the SF-36, but not on the physical component summary. On the mental and general health subscales, BPD patients and patients with other disorders had significantly lower scores than controls. Patients with BPD and patients with other disorders also had lower (worse) scores on Sheehan Disability Scale and had higher mean total scores (signifying greater impairment) on the Social Adjustment Scale—Self-report. Specifically, patients with BPD were the most impaired of the 3 study groups in the family unit role area of the Social Adjustment Scale—Self-report. Patients with BPD and patients with other disorders also had lower (worse) scores on the Social Adaptation Self-evaluation Scale compared with controls.

TREATMENT

The mean number of primary care visits made per year by patients with BPD was significantly lower than that of patients with other mental disorders and marginally lower than that of normal controls. Patients with BPD and those with other disorders reported similar rates of mental health treatment during the past year (7 [50%] and 25 [49%], respectively), compared with 13 (9.3%) in the controls. All patients who reported past-year mental health treatment also reported that they were prescribed psycho-

*Values are expressed as number (percentage) unless otherwise indicated. BPD indicates borderline personality disorder; OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval; and ellipses, data not applicable. Patients in the "Any Other Psychiatric Disorder" group have at least 1 psychiatric disorder. Borderline personality symptoms data were available for 49 patients with any other psychiatric disorder and 139 control subjects. Psychiatric comorbidity data were available for 50 patients with any other psychiatric disorder. Physicians' assessments were available for 170 patients. All statistics except for Psychiatric Comorbidity are adjusted for sex.

†Current prevalence.
‡Lifetime, using Structured Clinical Interview updated to Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fourth Edition.26
§Actual or threatened.
¶Based on Fisher exact test.
**Includes panic disorder, generalized anxiety disorder, social phobia, and simple phobia.
#Includes alcohol and other drug use disorders.
tropic medications during the same period. Approximately 1 in 5 BPD patients and patients with other disorders reported ever being psychiatrically hospitalized, compared with roughly 1 in 15 controls (Table 2).

### Table 2. Patients’ Self-report of Emotional Health, Physical Health, and Functioning and Medical Care*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Patients With BPD (n = 14)</th>
<th>Patients With Any Other Psychiatric Disorder (n = 51)</th>
<th>Control Subjects (n = 140)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Patients’ self-report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor/fair emotional health</td>
<td>11 (78.6)</td>
<td>39 (75.5)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR (95% CI)</td>
<td>7.4 (1.7-25.36)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor/fair physical health</td>
<td>9.7 (71.4)</td>
<td>42 (82.4)</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR (95% CI)</td>
<td>4.0 (0.49-5.58)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any disability†</td>
<td>8 (57.1)</td>
<td>31 (60.8)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR (95% CI)</td>
<td>3.82 (1.24-11.76)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SF-36 score, mean (SD)‡</td>
<td>36.0 (9.7)</td>
<td>37.3 (14.0)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental summary</td>
<td>42.3 (24.2)</td>
<td>42.9 (23.8)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental health</td>
<td>35.6 (7.5)</td>
<td>31.5 (10.2)</td>
<td>.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical summary</td>
<td>32.8 (22.8)</td>
<td>32.8 (22.8)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General health</td>
<td>31.1 (17.4)</td>
<td>31.1 (17.4)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS-SR total score, mean (SD)§</td>
<td>2.3 (0.4)</td>
<td>2.3 (0.6)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SASS total score, mean (SD)§</td>
<td>36.4 (10.1)</td>
<td>35.3 (8.7)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary care visits and mental health care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visits (per year)</td>
<td>4.1 (2.2)</td>
<td>7.9 (6.4)</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental health care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past year</td>
<td>7 (50.0)</td>
<td>25 (49.0)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ever</td>
<td>12 (85.7)</td>
<td>36 (70.6)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital admission (ever)</td>
<td>3 (21.4)</td>
<td>11 (21.6)</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Values are expressed as number (percentage) unless otherwise indicated. SF-36 indicates Medical Outcome Study 36-item Short-Form Health Survey30,31; SAS-SR, Social Adjustment Scale—Self-report37; and SASS, Social Adaptation Self-evaluation Scale. SF-36 summary scores were available for 197 patients; SAS-SR summary scores were available for 201 patients. All statistics, except for primary care visits, are adjusted for sex. Other abbreviations are given in the first footnote to Table 1.

†Measured using the Sheehan Disability Scale.24,25
‡Higher scores indicate better functioning.
§Higher scores indicate more impairment.
||Based on Kruskal-Wallis test for comparison between patients with BPD and patients with any other psychiatric disorder.

Four findings emerge from our study. First, we found a BPD prevalence of 6.4% in this primary care sample, a 4-fold higher prevalence than the median value found in most community surveys.11,12,17,37 Second, a high prevalence of current suicidal ideation (21.4%), current psychotic symptoms (71.4%), and current bipolar I (manic-depressive) disorder (21.4%) was detected in primary care patients with BPD; and third, significant psychosocial impairment of these patients was measured. Finally, only about half of these patients were recognized by their primary care physicians as having an ongoing emotional or mental health problem or had received mental health treatment during the past year.

### COMPARISON WITH OTHER STUDIES

Direct comparison of our findings with those of other published studies is difficult owing to the different sampling and assessment methods. The sample in the study by Sansone et al11,14 reported a 20% prevalence of symptoms suggestive of BPD in a sample of young women (mean age, 33.6 years) who were seen consecutively by a family physician in a health maintenance organization and who underwent screening for BPD using the Personality Diagnostic Questionnaire—Revised. Compared with a structured interview for personality disorders, however, the Personality Diagnostic Questionnaire diagnosed significantly more BPD in individuals undergoing screening.19,20,38

Hueston et al15 mailed a copy of the Structured Clinical Interview for DSM-IV to a nonrandom sample of 202 English-speaking, nonimmigrant patients of family practices. Of those who responded (response rate, 46%), 26% were identified as having BPD. Beyond the obvious selection bias in their study design, Hueston et al relied on the more limited and less specific self-report approach,11,15 without a confirmatory clinical interview.

Parsons16 used a convenience sample to study the prevalence of BPD in 965 patients of primary health centers in England and found a prevalence rate of 18.5% using the Diagnostic Interview Schedule—Borderline Index, an instrument that has been shown to overdiagnose BPD prevalence, perhaps because of some overlap in symptoms between Axis I psychiatric disorders and borderline personality as defined by the Diagnostic Interview Schedule.17

Very little can be learned from these studies concerning psychiatric comorbidity and functioning of BPD patients in primary care. Hueston et al15 found a higher overall mean score on the Beck Depression Inventory and on the CAGE questionnaire (C, Have you ever felt the need to cut down on your drinking? A, Have you ever felt annoyed by criticism of your drinking? G, Have you...
ever felt guilty about your drinking? and E, Have you ever taken a drink [eye opener] first thing in the morning?) for alcohol use and lower SF-36 scores in patients with personality disorders in general. Parsons found high scores on the Beck Depression Inventory in a subsample of his study’s participants (Shaun Parsons, PhD, written communication; January 13, 2000).

COMORBID PSYCHIATRIC SYMPTOMS AND DISORDERS

We found a 21.4% rate of current suicidal ideation in the BPD group. Half of the patients with BPD described recurrent suicidal behavior or threats or self-mutilating behavior in the clinical interview. Lifetime rates of completed suicide among clinical samples of patients with BPD range from 3% to 9.5%. A much higher percentage, probably ranging from 70% to 80%, exhibits self-harming behavior at least once. Since the Patient Health Questionnaire inquired about thoughts of hurting yourself, our suicidal ideation rate might include patients without suicidal intentions. However, any suicidal behavior, regardless of severity, places a person in a higher risk for completed suicide. Among patients with BPD, numerous previous attempts often predict more serious and fatal subsequent attempts. Moreover, Brodsky et al showed that impulsivity in BPD patients is associated with the number of lifetime suicide attempts. Similar to findings in BPD inpatients, patients with BPD in our sample had a high rate (71.4%) of impulsivity in at least 2 areas that are potentially self-damaging, compared with a much lower rate of 4.7% in study subjects without BPD.

Ten (71.4%) of the 14 BPD patients had at least 1 current psychotic symptom. Miller et al found a 27% rate of psychotic symptoms among BPD inpatients using medical chart reviews. Dowson et al showed that self-report of past psychotic phenomena was associated with BPD. Although transient paranoid ideation during periods of extreme stress is one of the diagnostic criteria for BPD, and was indeed found in 8 (57.1%) of the BPD patients in our study compared with 4 (2.1%) in well controls and patients with other mental disorders, the findings that BPD patients had an average of almost 5 lifetime psychotic symptoms and that 7 (50.0%) of them had current auditory or visual hallucinations suggest that psychotic symptoms are a frequent comorbid condition. Offson et al has shown in a separate study that psychotic symptoms in primary care were strongly associated with functional impairment.

Approximately one fifth (21.4%) of BPD patients met criteria for current bipolar I disorder. This rate is substantially higher than that reported in previous studies of BPD patients (0.3%-14.1%). For comparison, the lifetime prevalence of bipolar disorder in a large cross-national study was 0.3% to 1.5%. Only 1 study of BPD patients from an outpatient psychiatry clinic found rates of bipolar disorder (21.1%) similar to ours.

Although the rates of suicidal ideation, psychotic symptoms, and bipolar I disorder in the BPD group of our study exceeded those found in other studies, the comparison of rates for anxiety disorders, major depression, and the chronic and less severe dysthymic disorder showed less consistent results. Generally, the rates of these disorders in our BPD sample resembled those found in the community.

GENERALIZABILITY AND LIMITATIONS

These results can be safely generalized to primary care patients with similar sociodemographic characteristics, although Swartz et al did not find a significant relationship between socioeconomic status and BPD in the community, despite consistent observations of inverse relationship between socioeconomic status and overall rates of psychopathology. In addition, studies on BPD show that the disorder is predominantly diagnosed in young white women with a mean age in the middle of the third decade of life. Although data in these studies were derived mainly from clinical samples, and thus may reflect selection into treatment and biases of diagnosing clinicians rather than true differences, they suggest that the sociodemographics of our sample do not account for its high prevalence of BPD.

Generalizability of our results is also limited by the sampling strategy, by which frequent clinic attendees were more likely to be sampled than less frequent, presumably healthier attendees. Nevertheless, our results show that, in contrast to a common stereotype, BPD patients did not have a higher frequency of visits at the practice and thus were not more likely than other patients to be sampled for the study. This finding probably could not be explained by general health status, since comparison groups (BPD patients vs those with other mental disorders and BPD patients vs controls) were similar in age, sex, socioeconomic status, and SF-36 physical summary score. As we did not have information on visits to other primary care facilities in our data, we could not rule out the possibility that BPD patients attend additional clinics more than patients without BPD.

Four other limitations of this study include the relatively small sample size; the exclusion of patients older than 70 years (although BPD symptoms tend to wane with advancing age), sample selection bias that may have affected the results, although eligible nonrespondents shared similar basic demographic characteristics with the respondents; and inherent limitations in documenting the enduring longitudinal pattern of a personality disorder by means of an interview performed at a single point in time.

CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS

Unrecognized personality disorders may underlie difficult patient-physician relationships. Awareness of the existence of such disorders may enhance understanding and treatment of difficult patients. Primary care physicians seldom have the time or training to provide formal psychotherapy to patients with BPD. However, physicians might develop rapport, feel less frustrated, and perhaps even have a therapeutic effect by acquiring a working knowledge of BPD and following available recommendations. (Table 3).
Awareness of BPD in primary care, familiarity with its clinical features, and better clinical recognition of the disorder may also help to develop an effective treatment strategy for coexisting conditions. Borderline personality disorder complicates the diagnosis and treatment of depression and anxiety, 6,7 and most of those seeking help for depression in the United States go to a primary care physician. 8 Borderline personality disorder can also mask the clinical picture of bipolar disorder. This finding bears special clinical importance because of the frequent co-occurrence of the two, as our results show, and the hazards of improperly treated bipolar disorder.

The primary care physician should also be aware of the high rates of suicidal ideation among BPD patients. Up to two thirds of patients who attempt or commit suicide see their physician shortly before their attempt or death. 61,62 Impulsivity, a common and prominent symptom in BPD patients, plays a key role in suicide, suicide attempts, self-harm, and unstable relationships. Impulsivity-moderating drugs are among the more beneficial pharmacological treatments of BPD. 63,64 Recognizing this symptom may improve diagnosis of and therapy for BPD and help prevent suicide attempts.

Finally, impaired functioning and disability in patients with mental disorders may change accordingly with improvement in psychiatric symptoms. 20 Half of the BPD patients in our study reported that they had not received mental health treatment during the past year, and patients with BPD visited their primary care clinic less frequently than other patients. The latter may reflect BPD patients’ tendency toward noncompliance with medical treatment and follow-up, 24 and could reduce the primary care physician’s ability to recognize depressive episodes and suicidal intent on time. Scheduling brief, structured, frequent visits for these patients may prove helpful. In light of recent studies showing that various pharmacological treatments, especially mood stabilizers (eg, valproic acid) 65-67 and psychological interventions, 68-70 are effective in treating BPD symptoms, prompt referral for a mental health evaluation on suspecting BPD should be the rule.

Accepted for publication April 30, 2001.

This study was supported by investigator-initiated grants from Eli Lilly & Co, Indianapolis, Ind, and Pharma-